

MINUTES OF THE 25TH MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE OF BOARD OF GOVERNORS OF CENTRAL COUNCIL OF HOMOEOPATHY HELD ON 22.05.2019 AT NEW DELHI.

PRESENT

- | | | |
|-----------------------------|---|-------------|
| 1. Sh. Nilanjan Sanyal | - | Chairperson |
| 2. Dr. Anil Kumari Malhotra | - | Member |
| 3. Dr. Anil Khurana | - | Member |
| Dr. Kumar Vivekanand | - | Secretary |

Dr. D. Samba Murthy, Inspector and Shri Y.D. Vats, Asstt. Secretary (Admn.) were present to assist the Secretary during the meeting.

Agenda item No. 1

Confirmation of the Minutes of the 24th meeting of the Executive Committee of Board of Governors held on 15.05.2019 at New Delhi.

The Executive Committee confirmed the Minutes of its 24th meeting held on 15.05.2019 at New Delhi as circulated.

Agenda item No. 2

Action taken Report on the minutes of the 24th of Executive Committee of Board of Governors held on 15.05.2019 at New Delhi.

The Executive Committee noted the Action taken by the office of the Council on the Minutes of the 24th meeting of Executive Committee of Board of Governors of Central Council of Homoeopathy held on 15.05.2019 at New Delhi.

Agenda item No. 3

Audit Report on the Accounts of the Council for the year 2017-18.

The Executive Committee considered draft replies in respect of audit paras for the year 2017-18 and approved the same with the rider that 2nd para regarding CCIM may be deleted from the reply against Audit Para No. 2. The EC also noted that the recommendation of the audit team for settlement of 06 old paras out of total 07 paras.

The Executive Committee further decided to seek legal opinion from Council's Retainer Advocate on the pending issues of M/s Bedi & Bedi Associates, so that further course of action is taken accordingly and asked the office to take all required steps to recover the outstanding Inspection Fee.

Agenda item No. 4

Ministry's letter No.R.13040/126/2011-HD(Tech) dated 9.8.2018 regarding inclusion of BHMS degree qualification awarded by Vinoba Bhave University, Hazaribagh in Second Schedule of HCC Act, 1973

The Executive Committee recommended for inclusion of BHMS Degree qualification awarded by Vinoba Bhave University, Hazaribagh from 15.02.2018 to 08.03.2018 (if granted to the transferred students of Singhbhum Homoeopathic Medical College, Jamshedpur who have passed out and completed their internship during this period from Homoeopathic Medical College, Mihijam) and from 30.11.2017 to 31.12.2018 (if granted to the students who have passed out and completed their internship during this period from Devki Mahavir Homoeopathic Medical College, Garwah).

Agenda item No. 5

1. Inspection of Existing Homoeopathic Medical Colleges.

Sl. No.	Name of the College	Course(s) run/intake capacity	Date of Inspection	Report Dispatched on	Report received in CCH on	Remarks
1.	Hahnemann Homoeopathic Medical College, New Jail By-Pass Road, Karond, Bhopal-462 038.	B.H.M.S.(100)	10.05.19	11.05.19	13.05.19	Recommended for allowing admissions in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 with the intake capacity of 60 seats as eligibility of 06 lecturers with BHMS qualification is not established due to lack of details of their date of appointment being prior to 08.03.2013, subject to appointment of full-time higher faculty in Community medicine before commencement of new session.
2.	Vasundhara Raje Homoeopathic Medical College and Hospital, Mahadji Nagar, Shivpuri, Link Road, Gwalior-474 001.	B.H.M.S.(100)	10.05.19	11.05.19	13.05.19	Not recommended for allowing admission in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 as no improvement has been made in respect of deficiencies pointed out in last year's order denying admission. Deficiencies reflected in the report of inspection are as under: Teaching staff <ul style="list-style-type: none">As per visitor 03 Guest faculty in the Professor Cadre however as per annexure 09 Guest Faculty (08 Professor, 01 Reader) available.No Professor in Materia Medica & Repertory.Attendance: No Annexure

						<p>Provided.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Qualification of 24 Full time teachers is BHMS/DHMS & date of appointment is not mentioned. • In Acquittance Professor Dr K K Sharma of Practice of Medicine is not included however teaching staff list shows the name. • Diagnostic set (ENT) 01 available against the requirement of 03 in Hospital equipment. • Mummified bodies and Cadaver not available in dept. of Anatomy • ESR (Westergren/windtrobe) 02 against 04 in dept. of Pathology.
3.	Pioneer Homoeopathic Medical College, Pioneer Medical Campus, Near American School of Baroda, AT & P.O.:- Sayajipura Village, Near National Highway No:-8, Ajwa Cross Road, Vadodara.	B.H.M.S.(100)	10.05.19	10.05.19	13.05.19	Recommended for allowing admissions in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 with the intake capacity of 100 seats in existing UG (BHMS) course subject to appointment of 02 Guest faculties before commencement of new session.
4.	Sri Sathya Sai College of Homoeopathic Medical Science & Hospital, Dharwad	BHMS-50 seats	04.05.19	11.05.19	13.05.19	<p>Recommended for allowing admissions in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 with the intake capacity of 50 seats in existing UG (BHMS) course.</p> <p>The complaint which has been received from the Ministry of AYUSH being anonymous does not merit consideration. Even on merits it is false in respect of two teachers who are not shown in faculty list and for the other two teachers who are in faculty list, the attendance and acquittance roll reflect their names and hence the presumption of them being full time teachers is acceptable. Further the admission is for only 50 students requiring 24 full time teachers as against which 30 are available. Even without the two teachers mentioned in the complaint whose names figure in the attendance and acquittance roll,</p>

						the no. of full-time teachers would be 28 and more than the prescribed 24.
5.	Mayurbhanj Homoeopathic Medical College and Hospital, At & P.O. Baripada, Distt. Mayurbhanj, PIN- 757029.	B.H.M.S.(30)	16.05.19	17.05.19	21.05.19	<p>Not recommended for allowing admission in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 as gross deficiencies in IPD/OPD functioning found in surprise inspection (2nd inspection), significant deficiencies in hospital staff, teaching staff, equipment levels, etc. as per details in inspection report. Deficiencies reflected in the report of inspection are as under:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 23 FT available against the requirement of 24 and Attendance register shows 15 FT and teaching staff list shows 19 FT and acquittance shows 23 FT and among them 21 members are drawing only Rs 5000/pm). • No Guest Faculty available against the requirement of 08. • Principal is having BHMS qualification. • 02 faculty with DMS qualification with appointment date in 2015 and 2016 and 04 Faculty with BHMS with appointment date in 2018. • USG, Preparation room, Post Operative recovery room and Ambulance not available in hospital and IPD/OPD annexure shows data of 11 months. • Operation theatre reported as under construction in hospital. • Dietician (Part time) not available against the requirement of 01in hospital staff. • Artery forceps small and big 06 against 12, Oxygen Cylinder with stand 01 against 03, Diagnostic set (ENT) 01 against 03and Infra-red lamp not available against the requirement of 01in hospital equipment. • Reading room for students and

						<p>teaching faculty not as MSR and Internet facility not available in central library.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mummified bodies, Cadavers not available and college is not covered under the provisions of Anatomy Act in dept. of Anatomy • Microscope with oil immersion 15 against 25, ESR (Westergren/wintrobe) 02 against 04 and Specimens 15 against 25 in dept. of Pathology. • Medical Microscope 20 available against the requirement of 25, Stethographs or pneumographs not available against the requirement of 05, Electronic/Monopan balance not available against the requirement of 01, Educational CD, Audio Visual Aids, Bicycle Ergometer, Facility for Animal Experiments demonstration with the help of Audio-visual Aids, not available, and Biochemistry Laboratory has not been established separately in dept. of Physiology • Weapons 10 against 13, Models 05 against requirement of 10, Specimens (Organic, Inorganic, Poisons & Chemicals) 20 against 35, Indian Evidence Act, 1872, Lunacy Act and Borstal Schools Act not available in dept. of Forensic Medicine & Toxicology. • Educational Tour Conducted during the last year not conducted in dept. of Pharmacy. • Charts on History of Medicine and Books on History of Medicine not available in dept. of Organon of Medicine. • Computers 04 available against the requirement of 05 and
--	--	--	--	--	--	---

						<p>details of Computer Lab not available in dept. of Repertory</p> <p>2nd Report</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Teaching staff details not reported • Consultants of modern medicine not reported • Most of the items of hospital not available • Wards- 02 • Hospital staff except Medical Suptd and Sr MO all others are not available • Non teaching and supportive staff all are not available except Anatomy lab attendant, Pharmacy lab attendant and Pathology lab attendant and sanitation staff • Most of the items of the hospital equipment not available • Central library locked • Except Anatomy department all departmental staff are not available and locked.
6.	Chandola Homoeopathic Medical College, Rudrapur	BHMS 50	17.5.19	By hand	20.5.19	<p>Not recommended for allowing admission in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 due to gross deficiencies in teaching staff, hospital staff, hospital functioning, equipments levels, etc. as per details in inspection report. Deficiencies reflected in the report of inspection are as under</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Total number of Teaching faculty as per visitor is 41, as per attendance is 42 and as per acquittance is 40. • Dr Ram Nagina Singh, Practice of Medicine (DOA: 25.3.19) Full time teacher and having a break of 2 year 2 months approx (31.01.2017 to 24.03.2019). • The certificates of qualifications, experience of the teaching faculty not available to verify the same. • Details about PG qualification of Dr Jyoti Dutt, Lecturer, and Dept. of PoM joined on 1.3.19

					<p>not clear /incomplete.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SMO room common with Gynae OPD, USG available but sealed, Dressing room not available, Preparation room, post operative recovery room, surgeon room, nursing staff room not available and Labor room not functional in hospital. • The enclosed records of a patient OPD/IPD admission (No. 6728/19) show that the records are poorly maintained and have discrepancy even in terms of the treatment prescribed, examination findings etc. • Radiologist, Anesthetist and Pediatrician, Ward boy/ayas, Lab attendant and dark room attendant not available in hospital staff. • Lab technician and Lab attendant in Dept of physiology, Lab attendant in Dept of pharmacy and Lab technician and Lab attendant in Dept of Pathology not available in Non-teaching Staff. • 01 stretcher with trolley available against 02, 04 BP apparatus available against 05, 05 bed pans available against required 10, 01 chair trolley with wheels available against 02, Urine pots not available, Back rest not available and Infra red lamp not available in hospital equipment. • 02 dissection tables available against 04 and College is not covered under Anatomy Act in dept. of Anatomy. • 02 pneumographs available against 05, Facility for animal experiments demonstration with AV aids not available, 05 urinometer available against required 25, 08 albuminometers available
--	--	--	--	--	---

						<p>against required 10 and Stove not available in dept. of Physiology</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Specimens not in dept. of Practice of medicine. • 22 pill tiles available against 25 and 23 crucibles with tongs available against 25 in dept. of Pharmacy.
7.	Arihant Homoeopathic Medical College at Sendhwa Distt. Barbani-45166, MP	B.H.M.S.(50)	14.05.19	15.05.19	20.05.19	<p>Not recommended for allowing admission in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 due to significant deficiencies in teaching faculty, guest faculty, hospital staff, Hospital functioning and equipments levels, etc. as per details in inspection report. Deficiencies reflected in the report of inspection are as under:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 19 Fulltime available against the requirement of 24 and 02 Guest Faculty available in the reader cadre against the requirement of 08 however teaching staff list shows 17 Fulltime and 06 Guest Faculty and attendance register shows 20 FT and 06 GF among them 03 names are not reported in staff list. • No FT faculty available in department of Surgery and Practice of Medicine, no higher faculty available in Pharmacy and Repertory. • 01 full time faculty with BHMS qualification and with no date of appointment. • Data provided for Acquittance is incomplete. • Consultants of Modern medicine: Radiologist, Ophthalmologist and pediatrician not available • Provision for Superintendent Room, Senior Medical Officer Room, Staff nurse and Nursing Station/ Duty room, OT, Preparation room, Post-Op. Recovery Room, Space for sterilized linen, Surgeon Room, Nursing Staff Room, Rehabilitation Unit including

						<p>Physiotherapy and Yoga, USG and Ambulance not available in hospital.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Surgeon (General Surgery) is not available against the requirement of 01, Nursing Staff in charge not available requirement of 01, Nursing Staff not available against the requirement of 02, Ward boys/Ayas 02 available against the requirement of 03, Registration Clerk/Telephone Operator not available against the requirement of 01, Dietician (Part Time) not available against the requirement of 01, Radiologist, Yoga expert and Physiotherapist and Auxiliary Staff-Lab Attendant and Dark Room Attendant not available in hospital staff. • Suction Machine is not available against 01, Suction tube not available and Artery forceps, small and big 06 available against 12 in hospital equipment. • Photo copying and Internet facilities not available and cataloguing of books not done in central library. • Mummified bodies, Cadavers are not available and college not covered under the provisions of Anatomy Act in dept. of Anatomy. • Centrifuge Machine electric (Rotofix) is not available against the requirement 02, Anaerobic apparatus is not available against the requirement of 02, Colony Counter not available against 0, Pathological Specimens are not available against the requirement of 25, Chemical Reagents for Histopathology is not available and Models not available in dept. of Pathology. • Stethographs or pneumographs is not available against the
--	--	--	--	--	--	---

						<p>requirement of 05, Colour perception lantern (Edridge Green) is not available against the requirement of 01, Handgrip dynamometer not available against the requirement of 01, Double Distillation apparatus Glass not available against 01, Perimeter is 01 available against the requirement of 03, Facility for Animal Experiments demonstration with the help of Audio-visual Aids is not available, Wire gouge with asbestos, Centre hot plate is not available and Biochemistry Laboratory has not been established separately in dept. of Physiology.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Specimens not available in dept. of Practice of Medicine • Specimens not available in dept. of Surgery. • Barometer (Fortein) is not available against 01, Slow Sand filter model/Filter Berk Field is not available against 01, Rapid Sand Filter model is not available against 01, Filter Pasteum chamberland (complete set), Material concerning Communicable diseases, Information on display of Sociology not available, Refrigerator is non functioning and Arrangement for visit of students Health check-up Camps, Water Purification Plant, Milk Pasteurization Plant, Industries not done in dept. of Community Medicine • Pill tiles are 15 available against the requirement of 25, Glass apparatus for filtration with vacuum is not available against 02, Dissecting Microscope is not available against 02, Distillation Apparatus (Glass) is not available against 01 and Pyknometer (Specific Gravity Bottle) is not available against 02 in dept. of Pharmacy
--	--	--	--	--	--	---

						<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Software is not available against the requirement of 5 in dept. of Repertory.
8.	Dr. Rambalak Singh Gaya Homoeopathic Medical College & Hospital, Amwa, Bodh Gaya-824231, GAYA.	B.H.M.S.(50)	16.05.19	17.05.19	20.05.19	Not recommended for allowing admission in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 due to eligibility of 10 lecturers with BHMS/DHMS, whose Date of appointment has not been mentioned, being doubtful and hence there is shortage of faculty besides those of 05 professor & 08 reader whose dates of appointment are also not available.
9.	Sivaraj Homoeopathic Medical College & Research Institute, SiddharKovil Road, Thumbathulipatty, Perumampathy (P.O.), Salem-636307.	B.H.M.S.(50)	16.05.19	16.5.19	20.05.19	Not recommended for allowing admission in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 due to eligibility of large number of Readers (08) & Lecturers (07) not being established in the absence of their dates of appointment and no acquittance roll being available to establish the genuineness of prescribed strength of teaching faculty being available, besides other deficiencies as reflected in the report of inspection as under: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 07 Guest faculty available against the requirement of 08. • Qualification of 15 faculty (2 Professors 8 readers & 7 lecturers) have BHMS qualifications but date of appointment is not given. • Annexure of acquittance not available. • College has applied for to be covered under the provisions of anatomy act in dept. of Anatomy. • Arrangement for visit of students to industries reported as proposed in dept. of Community Medicine. • License for procuring alcohol/spirit has been applied for in dept. of Pharmacy.
10.	Ratnadeep Medical Foundation and Research Centre, Jamkhed Homoeopathic Medical College, Jhmkhed	B.H.M.S.(100)	15.05.19	16.5.19	20.05.19	Not recommended for allowing admission in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 due to eligibility of 02 Readers & 01 Lecturer with BHMS qualification

	(Ratnapur), Jamkhed, Ahmednagar	Tal. Dist.				<p>appointed from 2017 onwards was not established & no supporting documents for attendance, acquittance and details of teaching experiences etc., were available besides deficiencies reflected in the report of inspection as under:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 09 Guest faculty available against the requirement of 12 however teaching staff list shows 31 Full time and 09 Guest faculty and among them 08 FT are with BHMS/DHMS & Date of Appointment is 2017 Onwards and along with no teaching experience details. • Attendance annexure not available. • Acquittance annexure not available. • Name and Qualification of 01 Library Assistant available in central library, however 02 is mention in Non-Teaching and Supportive Staff. • Educational Tour Conducted planned soon in dept. of Pharmacy. • Reported as not applicable but Faculty available in dept. of Repertory.
11.	Kharagpur Homoeopathic Medical College and Hospital, At Kaushallya, P.O. Kharagpur-721 301. Distt. Midnapore.	B.H.M.S.(60)	14.05.19	15.5.19	20.05.19	Not recommended for allowing admission in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 due to eligibility of 06 Readers & 03 Lecturers with BHMS qualification could not be established in the absence of their dates of appointment, besides other deficiencies reflected in the department of college as per report of inspection.
12.	K.E.S.'s Chandrakant Hari Keluskar Homoeopathic Medical College, Alibag, Dist. Raigad-402 201.	B.H.M.S. (50)	16.05.19	17.05.19	20.05.19	Recommended for allowing admissions in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 with the intake capacity of 50 seats in existing UG (BHMS) course subject to fulfilment of all shortfalls as per details of inspection report before commencement of new session.

Agenda Item No.6

Consideration of inspection report of Athurasramam NSS Homoeopathic Medical College, at Kottayam, Kerala of Homoeopathic Medical Colleges for 2019-20.

The Executive Committee noted the letter dated 13.05.2019 of Principal, Athurasramam NSS Homoeopathic Medical College, at Kottayam, Kerala and decided not to recommend for allowing admission in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 as the college has admitted that the posts of hospital staff are not sanctioned as yet and they had moved to Govt. of Kerala to do so. Hence, the functionality of IPD is doubtful.

Agenda Item No.7

Application dated 28.02.2019 of the Chairman, G. Anuradha Education Trust, Bangalore for establishment of New Homoeopathic Medical College namely Anuradha Homoeopathic Medical College & Hospital at Bangalore, Karnataka for BHMS Course under section 12 A of HCC Act, 1973, from the academic session 2019-20 in compliance of order dated 13.08.2018 of the Hon'ble High Court of Karnataka in W.P. No. 47279-47280/2018 [EDN-REG.P]

The Executive Committee discussed the matter regarding non submission of the required documents sought from the college and took note of mail dated 22.05.2019 (wherein college has submitted that they have sent required documents through speed post) and decided to defer the matter for next meeting i.e. 27.05.2019.

Agenda Item No.8.1

Order dated 09.05.2019 of Hon'ble High Court of Delhi at New Delhi in W.P.(C) No.2829/2019 in respect of Rishiraj Singh Memorial Society, Habibganj Station, Bhopal(M.P.) for Opening of New H.M.C. in the name of "Narayan Shree Homoeopathic Medical College, Hospital and Research Centre, Indore(M.P.).

The Executive Committee discussed the Order dated 09.05.2019 of Hon'ble High Court of Delhi at New Delhi in W.P.(C) No.2829/2019 and agreed to process the application as per Establishment of New Homoeopathy Medical College, (Opening of New or Higher Course of Study or Training and Increase of Admission Capacity by a Medical College) Regulations and directed the office to call all deficient documents from the college and place before committee in next meeting.

Agenda Item No.8.2

A letter dated 24.04.2019 has been received from Ministry of AYUSH regarding VIP representation dated 10.04.2019 received from Secretary to the Vice-President of India in respect of MF (Hom) qualification.

The Executive Committee discussed the matter threadbare in respect of MF (Hom) qualification received through Medwin Hospital, Hyderabad and noted that MF (Hom), UK degree is the historical legacy which is continuing till date. There has been no unanimity between CCH and MCI or for that matter, between CCIM & MCI regarding graduates of each other disciplines (i.e. BHMS/MBBS) being allowed to practice

(perhaps to a prescribed extent) the other discipline after undergoing a bridge course in respect of the concerned other discipline. Effort was initiated by Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and the Dept. (later Ministry) of AYUSH, Government of India, in that regard in 2013-14. The then Council (CCH) had opposed the same. A holistic view is to be taken by all stakeholders, namely Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Ministry of AYUSH, CCH, CCIM, MCI and representative associations of practitioners of different discipline concerned as to whether or not to allow cross-pathy, perhaps to a limited extent. The course run at Hyderabad in collaboration with MF (Hom), UK cannot be considered to be eligible for recognition under Schedule III of the HCC Act as it is a course run in India, wherein MBBS graduates are trained in homoeopathy and hence tantamount to cross-pathy. This course at Hyderabad is without any consent or intimation to CCH as regards its details and cannot be recognized otherwise also till a consensus emerges on the issue of allowing cross-pathy in India.

Regarding, recognition of MF (Hom), UK it is a degree which is not in consonance of section 14 of HCC Act 1973, which stipulates mutual recognition of degrees, as UK does not recognize the degrees of homoeopathy regulated by CCH (BHMS & MD (Hom)). It has been historically recognized in India from the time the HCC Act came into being, perhaps because well known exponents and leading lights of Homoeopathy at that time were having that degree. Time has perhaps come to resolve this dichotomy with Ministry of AYUSH forcefully taking up mutual recognition of degrees of CCH & MF (Hom), UK with UK authorities, failing which it can be dropped from Schedule III of HCC Act.

As it has been observed earlier that the Faculty of Homoeopathy has imparted training in Homoeopathy in Hyderabad, India without permission of statutory bodies like CCH, the council therefore, does not recognize such qualification granted on the basis of the training conducted in India by the Faculty of Homoeopathy. The Faculty of Homoeopathy may be accordingly advised not to conduct such training and examination in Homoeopathy in India.

Further, the Ministry may take up the matter with the UK Authority pertaining to reciprocity in mutual recognition of each other's degrees and if it is unsuccessful, we can turn down the recognition of MF (Hom.), UK by invoking the section 14 of HCC Act, 1973 and delete it from Schedule III.

The EC proposed that the Ministry of AYUSH may frame a response to the VVIP reference keeping in view the above facts and logic.

The Executive Committee directed the office to complete the actions on the decisions in these minutes immediately, keeping in view of urgency of the matters.

Meeting ended with the vote of thanks to the Chair.

Attested
Sd/-
(Sh. Nilanjan Sanyal)
Chairperson

Sd/-
(Dr. Kumar Vivekanand)
Secretary